

## Evaluation of Ninth Grade English Curriculum in Terms of Holistic Education<sup>1</sup>

**Tuğba Babacan**

Dr., Anadolu University, Turkey, [tugbababacan@anadolu.edu.tr](mailto:tugbababacan@anadolu.edu.tr)

**M. Bahaddin Acat**

Prof. Dr., Kırıkkale University, Turkey, [mbacat@gmail.com](mailto:mbacat@gmail.com)

The study aims to evaluate 9th grade English curriculum within scope of holistic education. It was designed on mixed method. Quantitative data was collected with "Teaching Tendency Inventory" and "Attitude Scale Towards Foreign Language" adapted into Turkish by the researcher (Babacan, 2016) and also "Holistic Learning Tendency Scale" developed by the researcher (Babacan, 2016) in scope of this present study. Quantitative data was collected from 179 English teachers working at secondary education schools and from 1043 students determined by proportional stratified sampling method. Qualitative data was collected from observation of classrooms, from documents (curriculum, coursebooks, exams, observation notes) and from a total of eight English teachers and twenty-four students in four school types determined depending on stratified purposeful sampling strategy. Chi-square test, Mann-Whitney U test and Kruskal Wallis analysis of variance were performed on the quantitative data gathered from students and teachers. Qualitative data was analyzed by inductive content analysis and documents were analyzed by comparative qualitative analysis technique. According to results, it was observed that holistic education was not applied in current English education and there were reflections of mechanical approach. It was found that students who had high language skills and who used English outside classroom had a high holistic learning tendency. Moreover, these and also those who preferred some study types and also female students studying at science and social sciences high school had higher attitudes towards foreign language. As for teacher findings, it was determined that teachers preferred transactional teaching approach and differences that depend on school types were found out.

Keywords: holistic education, holistic curriculum, program evaluation, discrepancy evaluation model, English curriculum

### INTRODUCTION

In modern understanding of education, teacher is limited to applying curriculum and providing transfer of knowledge; students are evaluated as raw materials or inputs that go through rational education ensuring continuation of status quo. Positivist, centralist and status quo education approach has caused some problems in schools (Aslanargün, 2007). In our education system, information conveyed by teachers has been memorized instead of enabling students to think freely and flexibly, to be democratic, respectful, compassionate, socially just, and to use scientific methods (Gözütok, 2003). The child, who is turned into a "race horse" by comparison with other children, is always forced to be the first and the best in education (Göktürk & Günalan, 2006). Divisions and destructions occur, people feel independent from each other and disconnected from society, many of us find ourselves

---

<sup>1</sup> This paper is part of the article-based PhD thesis by one of the authors.

alienated from our bodies and hearts, we live in our minds where we abandon deep meanings and intuitions (Miller, 2007). Our children with this understanding have weakened their feelings, their thoughts have been shallow, their physical and emotional health have been shaken and free, self-confident, loving individuals have disappeared (Sloan, 2005). In order to make education qualified, to develop individuals as a whole and to transform society, there is a need for a more holistic understanding by moving away from divisions, instrumentalism and utilitarianism (Kaigama & Audu, 2014).

### **Holistic Education and Holistic Curriculum**

In global world, it has been understood that quality will be achieved with holistic education that progresses from pure knowledge to transformation, from academic excellence to character formation, personality development and moral perfection (Kaigama & Audu, 2014). Educating young people means emergence of creativity, compassion, curiosity, moral and aesthetic sensitivity, critical thinking skills, participation in democracy, in other words, holism (Venugopal, 2009). Holistic education is based on three basic principles: balance, inclusion and connections (Miller, 2007). In a holistic curriculum, connections between thought and intuition, connection between subjects, connections between body and mind, connections with soul, connections between individual and society, and connections with earth are included (Nava, 2001; Miller, 2007; Miller, 2010). Curriculum should include multicultural discussions, aesthetic and holistic research in which students can be in unity of body, soul and universe, and studies on ecological sustainability (Marsh, 2004). Three approaches are needed to raise child as a whole, and each approach can be used as needed. In teaching basic skills from transmissional; in acquisition of cognition, thinking and problem solving from transactional and transformational teaching can be used to build empathy, social responsibility and self-awareness (Miller, 1999; Miller, 2010). Transactional approach applies to problem solving including informational focus of transmissional approach. Transformational approach emphasizes holism as inclusiveness of transactional approach's emphasis on cognitive domain (Miller et al., 1990).

### **Foreign Language Education and Holism**

Traditional foreign language teaching approach envisages teaching language from small parts to larger structures in a hierarchical order (Liu, 2013). While learning a foreign language, it is unacceptable that linguistic abilities are divided or left incomplete and only grammatical production is provided (Phakiti, 2006). Nowadays, the issue of learning a language and personal traits of learners is essential; because educational psychology factors have been neglected for many years (Torabi, 2020). In context of Turkey, although foreign language teaching is provided from primary to university levels, existence of individuals who cannot speak and understand shows that foreign language teaching is insufficient (Can & Işık-Can, 2014). Some problems such as being irrelevant to real life, not addressing interests and needs of students, not making programs meaningful for students and teachers, not supporting students to learn English and neglecting affective domain exist at foreign language teaching in Turkey (Bağçeci, 2004; Anbarlı Kırkız, 2010; Merter, Kartal & Çağlar, 2012; Parker, 2012). A need for innovative programs based on holistic approach in language teaching occurs (Singireddy, 2014). It is emphasized that a holistic understanding in language learning and skills that makes language whole should be handled in an integrated manner and psychological, emotional and developmental needs of students should be focused on curriculum and extracurricular activities in teaching process (Myers & Hilliard, 1997). Current foreign education mainly focuses on cognitive adequacy and due to the separation, it then undergoes damaging effects. However, some researches only put emphasis on certain parameters and it has been determined that researches are based on just description studied in terms of holistic education and studies based on literature review (Huitt, 2011; Mahmoudi et al., 2012; Jeder, 2014); also some researches are just based on implementation of and evaluation of holistic education practices, moreover methodologically designed in just qualitative model (Seet & Chang,

2008; Neves, 2009; Venugopal & Kumari, 2010; Tirri, 2011; Charles, 2012; Lee et al., 2014; Papastamatis & Panitsides, 2014; Singireddy, 2014). In aspect of Turkish literature, holistic education has just begun to be studied in fact, few studies have already been carried out and they are limited only either to qualitative or quantitative design (Gültekin et al., 2012; Gültekin et al., 2013; Özdaş et al., 2014; Akmençe, 2016; Asri, 2019; Şahinoğlu, 2021; Altan & Yıldırım, 2022). Adolescence is a dynamic period for significant changes of physical, neurological, cognitive, and socioemotional developments (Silvers, 2022). As students at that age move toward adulthood, their bodies and minds change as a result their perceptions towards life also change. Gestanti & Nimasari (2021) remark that adolescence period is a time that students achieve a certain level at foreign language acquisition and they became aware of how far the competences they should achieve. In this study, as early adolescents both experience changes at whole developmental areas and have ideal time for opportunities to transform, it is aimed to evaluate 9<sup>th</sup> grade English curriculum within scope of holistic education in accordance with both teaching and learning. Evaluating the quality of foreign language education by multi-dimensional vision from both teachers and students representing teaching and learning and also gathering qualitative and quantitative data as a whole will form the base for innovations and improvements for especially 9<sup>th</sup> grade English education. In context of study, holistic learning tendency scale is developed for students and teaching tendency inventory is adapted into Turkish for teachers and both of them will contribute to field in terms of being pioneering data collection tools that can be used for holistic education. Moreover, this study is based on Provus discrepancy evaluation model and outstands from other studies.

### **Research Questions**

The study sought following research questions.

1. How is suitability of English teaching/learning process and teaching materials used in 9th grades and current English curriculum according to holistic education principles?
2. How is 9th grade English education evaluated by students and teachers according to holistic education?
3. How are attitudes of 9th grade students towards foreign language?
4. How are holistic learning tendencies of 9<sup>th</sup> grade students?
5. How are teaching tendencies of English teachers?

Based on the study, researchers, policy makers and practitioners will gain a vision of holistic approach in foreign language education and awareness in how to manage difficulties that come up; how to meet necessities and how to maximize foreign language education in terms of holistic vision.

### **METHOD**

#### **Research Design**

Research was designed as a mixed method. Finding out views of students and teachers; making observations in schools; analyzing documents led to multiple views in data collections and diversified data sources, as a result a holistic approach to present issue was also accomplished methodologically.

#### **Evaluation Model**

In this study, expectations created by stakeholders regarding an ideal program and principles in literature on holistic education were considered as design criteria (standards) of program and evaluated 9<sup>th</sup> grade English curriculum is considered as performance. As a result of analysis of data collected from teachers and students as stakeholders and related documents, English curriculum (performance) was compared with holistic education standards. Differences identified between performance and standards were presented as a product of program evaluation in research to form basis for English teaching programs to be developed.

**Population and Sample**

The participants of study were 9<sup>th</sup> grade students and 211 English teachers working at secondary education institutions in Denizli. All teachers were reached; but data was collected from only 179 English teachers. 65% of teachers were female and 35% of them male; 36% of them had 6-11 years; 41% of them had 12-17 years, 23% of them had 18 and more years of experience in this profession.

In research, proportional stratified sampling method was used to determine 9<sup>th</sup> grade students. Number of individuals selected from groups is proportional to size of group in universe (Christensen, 2015). Ratio of schools' number in each subgroup within study population was figured up. The schools to be selected from each subgroup were determined on basis of placement criteria published by Ministry of National Education and lower, upper, middle schools were determined. Thus, probability of selecting each school that could be at different levels within subgroups was increased. The data was collected from 1043 students, that is 167 students selected from 2 science and social sciences high schools; 247 students from 2 anatolian imam hatip high schools, 328 students from 7 vocational and technical anatolian high schools and 301 students from 6 anatolian high schools. 52% of students were female and 48% of them were male; 37% of students perceived themselves good at reading, 43% at writing, 36% at speaking, 41% at listening, 25% at vocabulary, 27% at grammar; 37% at social and communicative, 27% at cultural skills, 56% at group, 36% at individual, 71% at visual, 54% at auditory, 34% at physical work and 39% of them used English outside classroom.

**Participants**

In collection of qualitative data, teachers and students were determined based on stratified purposeful sampling strategy. Four schools where qualitative data would be collected were determined by taking into account criteria for use of coursebook prepared by Ministry of National Education and two volunteer teachers among medium level classroom in each subgroup. However, only science and social sciences high schools preferred foreign publishing house coursebooks. For this research, a male and a female teachers had to be picked from each sub-group. In all school types, both voluntarily participated except for the male teacher from the vocational and technical anatolian high school. As a result, the participants were 2 women. The teachers have worked in different types of schools from 7.5-21 years and participated in various in-service trainings.

Moreover, focus group interviews were conducted with a total of twenty-four students, six from each sub-group. Three of students participating in focus group interviews are girls and three are boys.

**Data Collection**

In the present study, after all legal permissions were taken, the researcher visited all secondary schools for gathering quantitative data of study and gave scales to teachers and students. Ten days later, the researcher collected the filled scales and then got the consent of teachers who agreed to participate in the qualitative data collection part of this study. In order to observe all four school types, the researcher followed a schedule. After the observation period, the researcher had become a part of the school community. Moreover, the researcher established a bond with students, determined the volunteers for the interview and made their parents to sign the consent form. The interviews took place depending on the availability of participants.

**Data Collection Tools****Teaching Tendency Inventory**

The data collection tool "A Curriculum Orientations Inventory" developed by Myers (2014) was adapted into Turkish by the researcher (Babacan, 2016). A sixty-item rating key was given to teachers for dimensions of "creating expectations, teaching that will maximize learning, assessment, and views on other aspects of learning/teaching". There are twenty statements for each approach, five for each dimension (transmissional teaching, transactional teaching, and transformational teaching. It was

requested that items in each line should be rated in range of 1-3. Spearman rank difference coefficient was between 0.79-0.86.

#### **Attitude Scale Towards Foreign Language**

The data collection tool called “Motivation for English as a global language questionnaire”, developed by Weger (2008) to determine students' attitudes towards language learning, was adapted into Turkish by the researcher (Babacan, 2016). The scale consisted of thirty items with five factors: self-confidence learning, attitudes towards learning English/society, international attitude, individual use of English, and value to learning English. Cronbach Alpha value was 0.94.

#### **Holistic Learning Tendency Scale**

In order to determine students' self-perception of their holistic development, a data collection tool was developed by the researcher to determine environmental, social, cultural, personal and spiritual dimensions (Babacan, 2016). The scale consisted of 13 items with three factors in dimensions of self-awareness, openness to differences and community service. Cronbach Alpha value was 0.68.

#### **Qualitative Data Collection Tools**

The teachers were interviewed with semi-structured form in order to reveal whether they included holistic teaching practices into the teaching process and whether the curriculum supported holistic vision in education or not. The students were interviewed with semi-structured form as well to reveal effects of practices, their expectations and opportunities in terms of holistic education. Moreover, observation form was created to reveal whether holistic education was implemented or not. A document analysis form was made to analyze English curriculum and teaching materials (coursebooks, exams, etc.).

#### **Research Validity, Reliability and Ethics**

In present study, it was aimed to eliminate possible weaknesses by providing a more detailed explanation of qualitative data as well as quantitative data. The reliability of research was increased by taking opinions of experts except the researcher in development of observation and interview forms and especially in qualitative analysis phase by getting different perspectives of other experts. Criteria of voluntariness was taken as basis in determination of class observed and interviewees. Identities of participants were hidden with the first letter and number of each school type (such as F1, F2, İ1, İ2, A1, A2, M1, M2) and data was shared only within scope of academic study. For ethical approval of research, Eskişehir Osmangazi University Education and Human Sciences Ethics Committee document was obtained.

#### **Data Analysis**

SPSS 16.0 program was used in analysis of quantitative data gathered in present study. Since teaching tendency inventory for teachers was a ranking-based data collection tool, nonparametric Chi-square test was used in analysis of the data. Also, in analysis of the data collected by scales of attitudes towards foreign language and holistic learning tendencies of students, nonparametric Mann-Whitney U test and Kruskal Wallis variance analysis were performed.

Content analysis was used for qualitative data. The data set was first read without coding. While open coding, line-by-line coding was done. In order to increase reliability of analysis, inter-coder consistency was carried out and an expert who was not a researcher of this study encoded 1/4 of the data. The percentage of agreement between two encoders was calculated as 71% for observation dataset, 95% for teacher interviews and 79% for student interviews. A code list was created from most frequently repeated codes among codes obtained as a result of decomposition of data. Codes thought to be related in code list are grouped and named. Themes were established by interpreting sub-themes associated with each other.

## FINDINGS

### Qualitative Findings

Qualitative findings gathered from observation notes by the researcher, documents and based on opinions of the teachers and students by interviews are presented below.

In aspect of observations, it was seen that there was an environment in which students were threatened both verbally and psychologically, being spoken to in a contemptuous manner and students were devalued, thus related theme is called “Devaluation of student”.

*The teacher threatened the students by saying that if they continued talking or didn't finish the page, the teacher would dismiss them from class or damage the grades... (Observation notes, I1)*

*It is a common thing for teachers to neglect the students under some conditions. When one of the students had broken a finger in a fight and the other one didn't attend the class, the teacher went on with the lesson without saying anything...(Observation notes, M1).*

From the observations, it was found that teachers mainly focused on the structural level of teaching, a teacher-centered teaching approach was prioritized, the lesson was being started without preliminary preparation and that teacher adapted a controlling role and used the grades as a power over students, the related theme is named as “Mechanical education”.

*The teacher gave students many exercises in form of question-answers and group work had never been observed. (Observation notes, F1).*

*Students who did not bring coursebook received a minus. Teacher attaches great importance to bringing book. (Observation notes, A2).*

From the observations, lacks of supporting material for English and presence of disinterested, bored students is gathered under the theme of “Negative classroom atmosphere”.

*Nothing was exhibited on walls and doors related to English studies. (Observation notes, A1).*

*As teacher failed to calm class, he tensed and started shouting. 'Stop, shut up, look here, etc..'. (Observation notes, M2).*

Based on observations, theme of “Activities increasing interest in lesson” includes an interesting question asked to warm lesson and activities that class enjoyed doing together.

*There are two fish in glass. One fish sees empty part of glass, the other sees glass half full. Teacher poses questions for students to talk about this topic and asks which fish they see themselves as. Teacher asks how people are in Turkey. Optimistic or pessimistic?. (Observation notes, F1).*

*When class is not willing to write, teacher says let's write together then. Teacher writes a sentence in beginning, then volunteer students add one sentence each. So class wrote an e-mail together and had a lot of fun. (Observation notes, A2).*

From the observations, it was seen that physical conditions were similar at each type of schools. Classroom layout was exactly the same, and even place of classroom materials (trash can, coat rack, teacher's desk, etc.) in classrooms was fixed. On the other hand, it was observed that only science and social sciences high schools and anatolian high schools had recycling bins. It was observed that food such as fruits and nuts were sold in school canteen at science and social sciences high schools, and there were flowers grown in corridors of anatolian imam hatip high school. Although there were whiteboards in every school type, it was witnessed that only science and social sciences high schools and anatolian high schools benefitted from them. In schools, desks were equipped with armrests and it was possible to change order at any time; however, classroom layout was formed in traditional straight

row format. In addition, it was observed that classrooms, especially in vocational technical anatolian high school, had not been used cleanly, there were students' footprints on the walls, desks had been scratched, scribbled, and garbage such as paper had been thrown on floor.

From analyzed curriculum findings, although English curriculum suggests educating students whole developed and using various teaching methods and techniques, it was determined that acquisitions were written mostly in cognitive dimension, and very few acquisitions were included in affective and psychomotor domains.

From analyzed coursebooks findings, it was marked that there were lots of traditional activities (matching, filling in blanks, true/false, report writing) and rarely speaking. Also, from analyzed exam papers, questions were prepared traditionally as well. However, in foreign publishing house books used by a school type, themes were compromised scientifically suggesting articles and research results.

According to interview findings of teachers, the theme of "Program limitations" contains of opinions of teachers on not achieving holistic development of students; need for flexibility and daily life skills in curriculum.

*M2: We are generally concerned with their intelligence. Learned or not, understood or not. So body, for example, needs to be active; but it does not support. Soul anyway, we don't even think about it, we don't even ask how they feel about, we're more interested in mind.*

*F1: Children are not aware of how to use knowledge. Our curriculum is very intense. But what do we do in high school? Again we start with "what is your name?"*

Depending on teacher interview findings, theme of "Factors limiting teaching" contains of situations summarizing structural obligations and need for practice-based activities.

*A2: We used to go to picnics, go to amusement park; but now institutions do not take responsibility and support anymore.*

*F2: Although it is said not to give priority to grammar, I think priority in program is definitely grammatical.*

From teacher interview findings, the theme including need for love, communication, respect and human values, is named as "Universal virtues".

*A2: They should have an open mind, look at every issue critically, say diversity is our wealth..*

*F2: It is very important that they should be individuals who are respectful to society and have developed empathy, without being stuck with dogmas or taboos.*

*I1: There should be children who think alternatively.*

From the students interview findings, the theme of "Lack of social cohesion" is reached with expressions that there was a need for unity in classroom and due to negative effects of competitive understanding in education they couldn't become a whole.

*A1: They taught us to have a good job, have a good income and have a good future, and that's why people start to see their desk mate, even a person with whom they share everything, as a competitor.*

*M5: Groupwork should be done, we should get to know our friends, we can decide in groupworks whether we can trust them or not.*

*M2: We, as girls are excluded in our own class, we are oppressed.*

Based on students interview findings, theme of “Standardization problem in education” has been reached by the fact that teaching was needed to be made diverse and fun, mechanical education approach broke desire to learn, standard assessment caused problems, qualified assessment was needed.

*A5: I don't think life is just about learning such structural things.*

*F1: I think it should be like a doctor-patient relationship.*

*F3: For example, we can do karaoke of English songs.*

*I1: Group work, doing it with friends is really funny. You can learn better.*

Depending on student interview, the theme related to expectation of being valued as an individual, necessity of gaining a world view, achievement of expected qualifications and fundamental rights to be provided on the way to become a universal human being is named as “Universalization in education”.

*M5: My expectation from education should be within the framework of respect and love.*

*A1: No one can reflect their own personality, we cannot reflect our thoughts, what all teachers say, 'We teach you to be an individual'. Are you teaching us to be individuals by putting us in a certain mold?*

*F4: I mean, global warming, for example. Because it is problem of whole world. Because there should be a reaction to them, they should increase awareness of people.*

### Quantitative Findings

In the quantitative part of this study, the findings of students' attitudes towards foreign language and holistic learning tendencies scales and teachers' teaching tendencies inventory are presented below.

Table 1

Mann-whitney u test results of attitudes towards foreign languages of students in terms of gender						
Gender	N	Sum of Ranks	Mean Rank	U	Z	p
Female	543	296753.50	546.51	1.224	-2.738	0.01*
Male	500	247692.50	495.38			
Total	1043					

(\*p<0.05)

As given in Table 1, it was concluded that female students had a higher level of positive attitude towards foreign language than male students (U=1.224; p<0.05).

Table 2

Mann-whitney u test results according to attitudes towards foreign languages of students in terms of using English outside class

Using English Outside Class	N	Sum of Ranks	Mean Rank	U	Z	p
Yes	411	288397	701.70	5.602	-15.537	0.01*
No	632	256049	405.14			
Total	1043					

(\*p<0.05)

As shown in Table 2, it was concluded that attitudes towards foreign languages of students who use English outside classroom are higher than students who do not use language outside classroom (U=5.602; p<0.05).



Table 3

Kruskal-Wallis test results of attitudes towards foreign languages of students in terms of linguistic and social, communicative and cultural skills

Skills	Level	N	Mean Rank	df	$\chi^2$	p	Difference
Reading	Should be developed	94	357.26	2	75.537	0.01*	1-2,1-3, 2-3
	Good	560 389	483.87				
	Very good		616.70				
Writing	Should be developed	135 463 445	341.80	2	78.470	0.01*	1-2,1-3, 2-3
	Good		501.82				
	Very good		597.66				
Speaking	Should be developed	199 466 378	343.27	2	87.864	0.01*	1-2, 1-3
	Good		553.58				
	Very good		577.17				
Listening	Should be developed	163 447 433	326.68	2	95.638	0.01*	1-2, 1-3, 2-3
	Good		520.24				
	Very good		597.34				
Vocabulary	Should be developed	180 608 255	391.64	2	49.442	0.01*	1-2, 1-3, 2-3
	Good		529.60				
	Very good		595.89				
Grammar	Should be developed	191 576 276	432.23	2	22.547	0.01*	1-2, 1-3
	Good		532.59				
	Very good		562.02				
Social	Should be developed	134 523 386	406.19	2	26.023	0.01*	1-2, 1-3
	Good		523.50				
	Very good		560.18				
Communicative	Should be developed	164 487 392	389.40	2	44.554	0.01*	1-2, 1-3, 2-3
	Good		522.90				
	Very good		576.36				
Cultural	Should be developed	224 532 287	384.73	2	69.032	0.01*	1-2, 1-3, 2-3
	Good		535.35				
	Very good		604.38				
Total		1043					

(\*p<0.05) 1= Should be developed, 2= Good, 3=Very good

As shown in Table 3, students who thought themselves that they were at “very good” level had the highest level of attitudes towards foreign languages. It was determined that students who perceived themselves at “good” level were at middle level of attitudes towards foreign languages and students who evaluated themselves at “must be developed” level were at the lowest level of attitudes towards foreign languages.

Table 4

Mann-Whitney u test results of attitudes towards foreign languages of students in terms of study types

Study types	Preference	N	Sum of Ranks	Mean Rank	Z	p
Group	Yes	588	322101.50	547.79 488.67	-	0.01*
	No	455	222344.50		3.144	
Individual	Yes	378	209791	555	-	0.01*
	No	665	334655	503.24	2.668	
Auditory	Yes	561	314056.50	559.82 477.99	-	0.01*
	No	482	230389.50		4.374	
Total		1043				

(\*p<0.05)

As shown in Table 4, a statistically significant difference was determined at group (U-group=1.186;p<0.05), at individual (U-Individual=1.132;p<0.05) and at auditory (U-Audio=1.140; p<0.05) study types.

Table 5

Kruskal-Wallis test results of attitudes towards foreign languages of students in terms of school types

School types	N	Mean Rank	df	$\chi^2$	p	Difference
Science and social sciences high school	167	596.01	3	21.8	0.01*	1-2* 1-3* 3-4*

(\*p<0.05) 1= Science and social sciences high school, 2=Anatolian imam hatip high school, 3= Vocational technical anatolian high school, 4= Anatolian high school

As given in Table 5, it was determined that attitudes towards foreign language of science and social sciences high school students are higher than other school types  $\chi^2(df=3, n=1043) = 21.8; p < 0.05$ .

There was no statistically significant difference between students' holistic learning tendencies and gender, school types, study types (U=134532.500; p>0.05;  $\chi^2(df=3, n=1043) = 4.451; p > 0.05$ ; U=127194.500, U=120559, U=111407, U=131572, U=114456; p>0.05).

Table 6

Kruskal-Wallis test results of holistic learning tendency of students in terms of linguistic and social, communicative and cultural skills

Skills	Level	N	Mean Rank	df	$\chi^2$	p	Difference
Reading	Should be developed	94	616.18	2	29.565	0.01*	1-2,1-3, 2-3
	Good	560	548.40				
	Very good	389	461.24				
Writing	Should be developed	135	647.40	2	39.482	0.01*	1-2,1-3, 2-3
	Good	463	537.69				
	Very good	445	467.63				
Speaking	Should be developed	199	655.06	2	59.935	0.01*	1-2, 1-3
	Good	466	522.22				
	Very good	378	451.68				
Listening	Should be developed	163	708.21	2	83.504	0.01*	1-2, 1-3, 2-3
	Good	447	517.45				
	Very good	433	456.60				
Vocabulary	Should be developed	180	615.11	2	32.538	0.01*	1-2, 1-3, 2-3
	Good	608	525.08				
	Very good	255	448.93				
Grammar	Should be developed	191	609.39	2	29.168	0.01*	1-2, 1-3
	Good	576	524.13				
	Very good	276	457.09				
Social	Should be developed	134	680.45	2	68.760	0.01*	1-2, 1-3
	Good	523	542.10				
	Very good	386	439.76				
Communicative	Should be developed	164	651.68	2	54.696	0.01*	1-2, 1-3, 2-3
	Good	487	536.52				
	Very good	392	449.70				
Cultural	Should be developed	224	661.84	2	81.907	0.01*	1-2, 1-3, 2-3
	Good	532	518.10				
	Very good	287	420.08				
Total		1043					

(\*p<0.05) 1= Should be developed, 2= Good, 3= Very good

As shown in Table 6, students who thought themselves that they were at "very good" level had the highest level of holistic learning tendencies. It was determined that students who perceived themselves

at “good” level were at medium level of holistic learning tendencies and students who stated themselves at “must be developed” level, were at the lowest level of holistic learning tendencies.

Table 7

Mann-Whitney u test results according to holistic learning tendency of students in terms of using English outside class

Using English outside class	N	Sum of Ranks	Mean Rank	U	Z	p
Yes	411	196588.500	478.32	111922.500	-3.793	0.01*
No	632	347857.500	550.41			
Total	1043					

(\*p<0.05)

As given in Table 7, it was concluded that students who used English outside classroom had a higher level of holistic learning tendency (U=111922.500; p<0.05).

More than half of teachers (59%) preferred transactional teaching respectively transformational (21%) and transmissional (20%) teaching tendencies. There is no statistically significant difference according to gender and professional seniority ( $\chi^2=0.736$ ; p>0.05;  $\chi^2=2.482$ ; p>0.05).

Table 8

Chi-Square test results of teaching tendency of teachers in terms of school type

School type		Transmissional	Transactional	Transformational	Total
Science and social sciences high school	Observed	4	4	8	16
	Expected	3.1	9.5	3.4	
	Difference	0.9	-5.5	4.6	
Anatolian imam hatip high schools	Observed	4	17	2	23
	Expected	4.5	13.6	4.9	
	Difference	-0.5	3.4	-2.9	
Vocational technical anatolian high school	Observed	12	42	12	66
	Expected	12.9	39.1	14	
	Difference	-0.9	2.9	-2	
Anatolian high school	Observed	15	43	16	74
	Expected	14.5	43.8	15.7	
	Difference	0.5	-0.8	0.3	
Total		35	106	38	179

(\*p<0.05)

As seen in Table 8, a statistically significant difference was found in instructional tendencies of teachers according to school types ( $\chi^2=12.018$ ; p<0.05). It was seen that the most difference was that less than the expected value for teachers working at science and social sciences high school preferred transactional teaching tendency. On the other hand, it was determined that more people than expected value preferred transformational and transmissional teaching respectively.

## CONCLUSION, DISCUSSION AND SUGGESTIONS

To conclude, physical arrangements, psychological attachments and engaging activities form self-perceptions of students that result in positive or negative effects of foreign language learning process in terms of holistic education.

Imbalance between theory and practice causes separation, paralyzes students' vision and makes language lose its integrity.

Organizing foreign language learning process with mechanical-based activities may cause learners to use language only with its structural function and damage integrity of language.

Holistic language education vision requires conscious individuals who can keep up with today's world, have a democratic understanding and are in contact with their environment and society.

Current English language education is not carried out with principles of inclusiveness and balance; because transmissional teaching is mainly utilized.

Learners expect to be valued as individuals in foreign language learning process in which respectful, tolerant, fair, democratic and also free thinking is supported and empathetic behaviors are included.

Students believe that gender, high self-esteem, level of skills in language and life, effective study types and authentic English use affect to have high attitudes towards foreign language.

Students believe that level of skills in language and life and also authentic English use affect to have high holistic learning tendency.

Teachers believe that school environment that they work in affects their holistic teaching tendencies except for the gender and years of experience.

### **Suitability of English teaching/learning process and teaching materials**

Based on observations, it can be asserted that in a classroom atmosphere where students' ideas were humiliated and threatened with grades and punishments, it is normal for students to lose interest in lessons, fail to engage and develop their potential. Reyes et al. (2012), Range, Carnes-Holt Bruce (2013) reveal that as a result of establishing classroom climate on basis of sincere, respectful and emotionally supportive relationships, learners' interest in learning increases, they form a bond with learning process and they are academically successful. In this study, it is understood that students were bored with ongoing monotony, but enjoyed learning while interacting with and doing activities together as a class. Da Luz (2015) concludes that positive interaction between a teacher and a student, methods and strategies used in lesson increase motivation of learners towards learning. In this study, as seating arrangements of students and position of belongings in classrooms were the same, it can be said that flexibility in English learning process couldn't be achieved and standardization created in minds was also reflected in physical dimension. However, for teachers who adopt holistic education approach, it is necessary to design seating arrangement to allow learners to do group work (Charles, 2012). Depending on not observing exhibition of English materials in schools, it can be argued that foreign language learning process was not integrated with learning environment. In addition, due to lack of using interactive whiteboards, learners were especially deficient in listening skills. However, while learning a foreign language, it is necessary to have visual, auditory and tactile activities that appeal to all linguistic skills in order to preserve integrity of language. Moghadam & Adel (2011) states that it is necessary to construct teaching-learning environment close to reality and to carry out activities suitable for integrated language use. It also can be claimed that plants in corridors of anatolian imam hatip high school; presence of recycling bins for waste materials in anatolian high schools and in science and social sciences high schools as well as their canteen with healthy foods such as fruits and nuts allowed learners to connect with environment and body in these school types. It was determined that only vocational and technical anatolian high schools had dirty walls and desks had been damaged. This result can be explained by negative perception created in society regarding vocational high school student profile and quality of education as well as the fact that students do not respect themselves and they do not have a sense of belonging to school.

Despite the aims of curriculum focused on raising individuals holistically, curriculum was established in an imbalanced way, so learners' integrity in mind-body-soul connection was damaged. Similar to current situation in Turkey, individuals are mainly trained in cognitive field in education program and teaching methods in Nigeria and experience imbalance between affective and psychomotor domains

(Nakpodia, 2011). Although the principle of balance for evaluation was theoretically emphasized in curriculum, but was not used effectively.

Due to the fact that there was no diversity in school coursebooks like in foreign publishing coursebook used in science and social sciences high school made students uninterested and bored. It was revealed that activities in coursebooks were mostly done to reinforce structural learning of language, such as filling in the blanks, matching, true/false, sequencing and that causes contradiction principles of both balance and inclusivity of holistic education. In fact, it is necessary for teachers to adopt a more transformational approach by making use of activities such as discussion, games and drama (Charles, 2012).

### **Students and teachers' opinions on current English education in terms of holistic vision**

According to opinions of students and teachers, it was understood that mind-body-soul connection was not established in a balanced way in order to develop individuals holistically in foreign language education and there were no opportunities to use language in real life. Santwani (2015) states that individuals have to lead a meaningless and unbalanced life if being raised in a certain domain. This study revealed that love, respect and communication were necessary for effective English teaching. It can be argued that establishment of love, respect and healthy communication in education would contribute to learning process and that students were expected to have universal qualifications due to universal nature of foreign language. It is already believed that values such as peace, honesty, equality, cooperation, love and understanding should be taken into account in holistic education process (Gültekin et al., 2013). In addition, it was revealed that there was a need for learners to acquire qualities such as being a researcher, being responsible, being open-minded, critical thinking, being sensitive, and empathizing. Learning roles in holistic education environments are summarized as individuals who think creatively, have a flexible understanding and have characteristics of responsible and democratic citizens (Santwani, 2015).

According to teachers and students' opinions, it can be claimed that dominance of a mechanical education approach in English teaching/learning process and the fact that learners learned English at a more structured level caused them to not enjoy learning English. The standardization movement in education and exercises at structural level will result in affecting depth of learning, and will standardize thinking (Amrein & Berliner, 2003).

According to students, competitive understanding in classroom caused them to feel that they were competing with each other and being alone in classroom was established, so learning process was damaged. On the contrary, in holistic education approach, teachers are expected to place feelings of cooperation instead of competition in classrooms (Saw, 2015). It is understood that because of lack of unity, learners distanced themselves from each other, became alienated, couldn't feel consciousness of being a community and social integrity was not established. This may cause students to feel deprived of unity and feel alone in learning process. Sahlberg (2006) states that current education system is based on measurements, comparisons and ranking also there is a need for more cooperation and unity instead of divisions brought about by competitive understanding. It can be said that traditional understanding of education was adopted in current English education and monotonous process of language learning caused students to develop negative attitudes towards learning English. It can be said that English education process was not organized for students' learning styles and interests, the students did not want to be educated in a standardized way and they believed that language education should be related to real world. Similar to this situation, Singireddy (2014) states that in order to raise holistic individuals in foreign language learning process, it is necessary to use approaches suitable for today's needs instead of traditional education approach.

**Attitudes of students towards foreign language**

The higher attitudes towards foreign languages of female students can be explained by the fact that females were more inclined to develop linguistic skills than males. Similarly, López Rúa (2006) states that girls are more prone to linguistic intelligence and are more motivated. Also, it can be said that students' beliefs about educational environment and their perceptions about learning English were related to the fact that students in science and social sciences high schools had higher attitudes towards foreign language and students in vocational technical anatolian high schools were at the lowest level. Greene et al. (2004) and Hardré et al. (2009) reveal that learners' perceptions of learning environments have an impact on their motivation for learning. In this study, it was understood that if the students' perceived proficiency in language and life skills was high, their attitudes towards foreign language were also high and if the perceived proficiency was low, then their attitudes were also low. Similar to this situation, Rahimi & Abedini (2009) determine that there is a positive correlation between perception of efficacy of Iranian students and their listening skill levels. The fact that students who preferred group, individual and auditory study type had a high attitude towards English may be explained with they needed effective ways to use and hear foreign language in a real sense, as they were already bored with doing too much mechanical activities. Regarding this situation, Can & Işık-Can (2014) conclude that foreign language lessons are taught mainly on knowledge and memorization, written materials are used instead of visual and auditory materials and learners see this as a big problem. In this study, it can be said that students were more motivated to learn English when they had opportunity to use English outside classroom. It may have resulted in that students who used English in their daily lives internalized learning English meaningfully and developed highly positive attitudes towards language learning. Similar to this situation, Charles (2012) concludes that by providing active learning in a foreign language, learners successfully develop linguistic skills in authentic situations.

**Holistic learning tendencies of students**

In this research, it can be explained that holistic learning tendencies did not differ in terms of gender, school types and study types; because, current education was not arranged with regard to holistic education. Apart from this, it was found that students who developed themselves in different skills as well as linguistic skills and students who used English outside class had high holistic learning tendencies. It can be said that individual's integration with foreign language is also effective in gaining holistic learning tendencies. Charles (2012) concludes that the bond that learners establish with language learned outside classroom in foreign language learning process creates relationship between holistic education and language teaching.

**Teaching tendencies of English teachers**

In this study, it can be asserted that English teachers did not have a holistic teaching vision. The results show that they mostly were dominated at transactional teaching tendency and preferred the transmissional and transformational teaching tendencies to a lesser extent. Papastamatis & Panitsides (2014) emphasize that highlighting a certain teaching approach cannot ensure integrity of learners in mind-body-soul connections. In this study, it was concluded that teachers' holistic teaching tendency preferences did not differ in terms of gender. It can be explained by the fact that personal characteristics were not effective in holistic self-development of a person, but may be affected by their experiences and beliefs. Ubuz & Sarı (2009) concludes that a good teacher should be compassionate, tolerant, patient, loving, like parents and concerned. The fact that teaching tendencies did not differ with regards to professional seniority could be explained in expectations of education system from a teacher at a certain output and under that routine teacher did not need to diversify themselves. It was concluded that teaching tendencies varied according to types of school teachers worked at; because school atmosphere, climate and opportunities formed teacher vision. The fact that teachers working at anatolian high school and science and social sciences high school preferred more than one teaching

tendencies and especially the one that they mainly focused on was transformational teaching tendency showed that teachers working at these types of schools had developed their holistic teaching qualities. However, it could be said that teachers working at vocational technical anatolian high schools and anatolian imam hatip high schools did not have holistic teaching qualifications because they were more dominant in transactional teaching and they focused on mostly a single dimension (mind) in teaching process. We need all three approaches (transmissional, transactional, transformational approaches) to raise individuals as a whole and each approach can be utilized according to the needs (Miller, 1999; Miller, 2010).

It is necessary to abandon structural vision in foreign language education, diversify approaches, adopt democratic education, support integration where the participants feel unity, make conditions of classrooms flexible, ensure balance between cognitive, affective and psychomotor domains in curriculum. Practitioners should mainly focus on establishing groupwork over individualism; cooperation over competition; inclusiveness over standards and fairness over inequalities. Policy makers should enrich the materials that support holistic vision and make teachers open minded in terms of teaching approaches. In addition to that, they should try to close the gap caused by the separation between school types. Researchers may study on how to implement and evaluate the effectiveness of holistic approach in foreign language education.

#### REFERENCES

- Akmeççe, A.E. (2016). *İngilizce öğretiminde holistik (bütünsel) yaklaşım* (Yayımlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi). Fırat Üniversitesi, Elâzığ.
- Altan, M.Z. & Yıldırım, T. (2022). Bütüncül eğitim, bütüncül gelişim, bütüncül insan. *Eğitimde Yeni Yaklaşımlar Dergisi*, 5(1), 68-77.
- Amrein, A. L., Berliner, D. C. (2003). The effects of high stakes testing on student motivation and learning. *Educational Leadership*, 60(5), 32-38.
- Anbarlı Kırkız, Y. (2010). *Öğrencilerin İngilizce dersine ait tutumları ile akademik başarıları arasındaki ilişki* (Yayımlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi). Trakya Üniversitesi, Edirne.
- Aslanargün, E. (2007). Modern eğitim yönetimi anlayışına yönelik eleştiriler ve postmodern eğitim yönetimi. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi*, 50, 195-212.
- Asri, S. (2019, Nisan). İslam eğitimine yön veren öncüler doğrultusunda bireyin eğitimine holistik/bütüncül yaklaşım. *Uluslararası İslam Eğitimi Kongresi*, İstanbul.
- Babacan, T. (2016). *Dokuzuncu sınıf İngilizce dersi öğretim programının bütüncül eğitime göre değerlendirilmesi* (Yayımlanmamış doktora tezi). Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi, Eskişehir.
- Bağçeci, B. (2004, Temmuz). Ortaöğretim kurumlarında İngilizce öğretimine ilişkin öğrenci tutumları (Gaziantep ili örneği). *XIII. Ulusal Eğitim Bilimleri Kurultayı*, Malatya.
- Can, E., & Işık-Can, C. (2014). Türkiye’de ikinci yabancı dil öğretiminde karşılaşılan sorunlar. *Trakya Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 4(2), 43-63.
- Charles, M. (2012). *The heart and soul of language teaching: Making inter-connections between holistic and second language education in the postsecondary context* (Unpublished doctorate dissertation). University of Toronto, Toronto.
- Christensen, L. B., Johnson, R. B., & Turner, L. A. (2015). Değişkenlerin ölçülmesi ve örneklem (M. Sever, Z. Avcı Yurtseven, Çev.). A. Aypay, (Ed). *Araştırma yöntemleri desen ve analiz* içinde (ss.149-180). Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.

- Da Luz, F. S. D. R. (2015). *The relationship between teachers and students in the classroom: Communicative language teaching approach and cooperative learning strategy to improve learning* (Unpublished master of arts thesis). Bridgewater State University, Massachusetts.
- Gestanti, R. A., & Nimasari, E. P. (2021). High school students' foreign language acquisition and their English achievement. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 8(1), 495-502.
- Göktürk, İ., & Günalan, M. (2006). Modern ve geleneksel değerler arasında yabancılaşan insan. *Selçuk Üniversitesi Karaman İ.İ.B.F. Dergisi*, 11, 127-143.
- Gözütok, F. D. (2003). Curriculum development in Turkey. William F. Pinar (Ed.), In *International handbook of curriculum research* (pp.607-623). Mahwah, New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
- Greene, B. A., Miller, R. B., Crowson, H. M., Duke, B. L., & Akey, K. L. (2004). Predicting high school students cognitive engagement and achievement: Contributions of classroom perceptions and motivation. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 29, 462-482.
- Gültekin, M., Merç, A., & Ciğerci, F. M. (2012, Eylül). Holistik (bütüncül) eğitimin ilköğretim programlarına yansımaları. 2. *Ulusal Eğitim Programları ve Öğretim Kongresi*, Bolu.
- Gültekin, M., Ciğerci, F. M., & Merç, A. (2013). Holistic education. *Journal of Education and Future*, 3, 53-60.
- Hardré, P. L., Sullivan, D. W., & Crowson, H. M. (2009). Student characteristics and motivation in rural high schools. *Journal of Research in Rural Education*, 24(16), 1-19.
- Huitt, W. (2011, May). A holistic view of education and schooling: Guiding students to develop capacities, acquire virtues, and provide service. *12th Annual International Conference*. Athens, Greece.
- Jeder, D. (2014). Transdisciplinarity-The advantage of a holistic approach to life. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 137, 127 – 131.
- Kaigama, M. D., & Audu, H. (2014). Holistic education: A needful system of education for learners in conflict affected areas in Nigeria. *IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education (IOSR-JRME)*, 4 (4), 23-28.
- Lee, D. H. L., Hong, H., & Niemi, H. (2014). A contextualized account of holistic education in Finland and Singapore: Implications on Singapore educational context. *Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 23(4), 871-884.
- Liu, P. L. (2013). Implementation of the whole language in Hong Kong kindergartens: The teachers' perceptive. *Open Journal of Modern Linguistics*, 3(3), 167-173.
- López Rúa, P. (2006). The sex variable in foreign language learning: An integrative approach. *Porta Linguarum*, 6, 99-114.
- Mahmoudi, S., Jafari, E., Nasrabadi, H. A., & Liaghatdar, M. J. (2012). Holistic education: An approach for 21 century. *International Education Studies*, 5(2), 178-186.
- Marsh, C. (2004). *Key concepts for understanding curriculum* (Third edition). Oxon: Routledge-Falmer.



- Merter, F., Kartal, Ş., & Çağlar, İ. (2012). Ortaöğretim İngilizce dersi yeni öğretim programının öğretmen görüşlerine göre değerlendirilmesi. *Mehmet Akif Ersoy Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 23, 43-58.
- Miller, J. P., Cassie, J. R. B., & Drake, S. M. (1990). *Holistic learning: A teacher's guide to integrated studies*. Canada: OISE Press.
- Miller, J. P. (1999). Making connections through holistic learning. *Educational Leadership*, 56(4), 46-48.
- Miller, J. P. (2007). *The holistic curriculum*. (Second edition) Canada: University of Toronto Press.
- Miller, J. P. (2010). *Whole child education*. USA: University of Toronto Press.
- Moghadam, J. N., & Adel, S. M. R. (2011). The importance of whole language approach in teaching English to intermediate Iranian EFL learners. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 1(11), 1643-1654.
- Myers, J. (2014, June). Understanding your beliefs about teaching: Developing a language for teacher reflection for meaningful change. *The International Council on Education for Teaching 58th World Assembly*, Ontario, Canada.
- Myers, J. W., & Hilliard, R. D. (1997). Holistic language learning at middle level. *Childhood Education*, 73(5), 286-289.
- Nakpodia, E. D. (2011). Early childhood education: Its policy formulation and implementation in Nigerian educational system. *African Journal of Political Science and International Relations*, 5 (3), 159-163.
- Nava, R. G. (2001). *Holistic education: Pedagogy of universal love*. Brandon: Foundations of Educational Renewal.
- Neves, A. C. (2009). *A holistic approach to the Ontario curriculum: Moving to a more coherent curriculum* (Unpublished master of arts). University of Toronto, Toronto.
- Özdaş, F., Akpınar, B., Batdı, V., Karahan, O., & Yıldırım, B. (2014, March). The whole humanbeing paradigm and holistic curriculum approach. *International conference: New perspectives in science education*. Florence, Italy.
- Paker, T. (2012). Türkiye'de neden yabancı dil (İngilizce) öğretmiyoruz ve neden öğrencilerimiz iletişim kurabilecek düzeyde İngilizce öğrenemiyor?. *Pamukkale Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 32, 89-94.
- Papastamatis, A., & Panitsides, E. A. (2014). Transformative learning: Advocating for a holistic approach. *Review of European Studies*, 6(4), 74-81.
- Phakiti, A. (2006). Theoretical and pedagogical issues in ESL/EFL teaching of strategic reading. *University of Sydney Papers in TESOL*, 1, 19-50.
- Rahimi, A., & Abedini, A. (2009). The interface between EFL learners self-efficacy concerning listening comprehension and listening proficiency. *Novitas-ROYAL*, 3(1), 14-28.
- Range, B., Carnes-Holt, K., & Bruce, M. A. (2013). Engaging middle-grade students to learn in a caring community. *The Clearing House*, 86, 48-52.

- Reyes, M. R., Brackett, M. A., Rivers, S. E., White, M., & Salovey, P. (2012). Classroom emotional climate, student engagement, and academic achievement. *Journal of Educational Psychology, 104* (3), 700–712.
- Sahlberg, P. (2006). Education reform for raising economic competitiveness. *Journal of Educational Change, 7*, 259–287.
- Santwani, S. A. (2015). Holistic education for holistic life. *Horizons of Holistic Education, 2*, 33-39.
- Saw, G. P. (2015). A framework of holistic education. *International Journal of Innovative Research & Development, 2*(8), 69-74.
- Seet, J. F., & Chang, A. (2008). Developing a model for the holistic learning and teaching of Chinese language in Singapore. *New Horizons in Education, 56*(2), 75-91.
- Silvers, J.A. (2022). Adolescence as a pivotal period for emotion regulation development. *Current Opinion in Psychology, 44*, 258-263.
- Singireddy, V. (2014). Innovative curriculum in ELT: A pathway for holistic learners. *International Journal of English Language, Literature and Humanities, 1*(5),142-148.
- Sloan, D. (2005). Education and the modern assault on being human: Nurturing body, soul, and spirit. J.P. Miller, S. Karsten, D. Denton, D.Orr,&I. Colalillo Kates (Eds.), In *Holistic learning and spirituality in education: Breaking new ground* (pp.27-47). USA: New York Press.
- Şahinoğlu, S. (2021). Eğitimde holistik (bütünsel) yaklaşım ve din eğitimi (Yayımlanmamış doktora tezi). İstanbul Üniversitesi, İstanbul.
- Torabi, S. (2020). The Relationship between Iranian intermediate EFL learners' speaking skill, self-actualization and creativity. *Anatolian Journal of Education, 5*(1), 91-104.
- Tirri, K. (2011). Holistic school pedagogy and values: Finnish teachers' and students' perspectives. *International Journal of Educational Research, 50*, 159-165.
- Ubuz, B., & Sarı, S. (2009). Sınıf öğretmeni adaylarının iyi öğretmen olma ile ilgili görüşleri. *Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 28*, 53-61.
- Venugopal, K. (2009). The philosophical underpinnings of holistic education, *Journal of The Krishnamurti Schools, 13*, 69-73.
- Venugopal, K., & Kumari, P. (2010). Auroville school and holistic education. *Encounter, 23*(3), 59-63.
- Weger, H. D. (2008). *Learner motivations and preferences: Realities in the language classroom* (Unpublished doctorate dissertation). Georgetown University